GUIDELINES FOR PAPER DISCUSSIONS AT LAB MEETING
Bogdanove Laboratory

The paper(s) to be discussed should be selected by the presenter, in consultation with Adam. The presenter should e-mail a link or a pdf of the paper to boglab@iastate.edu one week prior to the discussion. A day or two before the discussion, the presenter should e-mail a list of questions he or she would like to focus on in the discussion.

For the discussion, the presenter should briefly (10 minutes or less) summarize the paper. This summary may include some background material, but should focus on the main figures and other data (including how the experiments were done), and the conclusions.

The presenter should then lead the discussion (ask the questions) about some or all of the following topics. Everyone should be prepared to contribute.

A. Paper critique
   1. Does the research address an important question?
   2. Is the experimental approach sound?
   3. Are the results presented clearly? Are figures and tables useful?
   4. Do the results justify the conclusions?
   5. Are the results significant? Why?
   6. Overall, what are the strengths and weaknesses of the paper?
   7. Would you recommend it for publication?
   8. Would you suggest any changes?

B. Research planning
   1. What important questions does the paper raise?
   2. What new hypotheses does the research suggest?
   3. What new avenues of discovery does the paper make possible?
   4. What would you do next to continue the line of research presented in the paper?

C. Relevance to our research
   1. Are the findings, questions, or hypotheses associated with the paper relevant to your project? The overall goals of the lab? How?
   2. Are any of the methods applicable to your project?
   3. Are there any resources reported in the paper that would be useful? How?